

CS 528 Critique Guidelines

The summary is supposed to capture the key points of a paper or book section. The summary should include a brief description of the work done/material discussed in the paper/book section and *should not exceed half a page per paper*. Do not mimic the abstract or cut-and-paste sections blindly. You should be able to read the summary in a year's time and recall the key aspects of the paper without re-reading the paper. Try to include some details regarding new concepts, algorithms and tools proposed.

Most of the papers covered are picked from top mobile computing conferences. They were accepted at those conferences because they proposed some new idea that the reviewers liked. What's the problem addressed in the paper and why is it important? If the paper is a research paper, what are their main contributions? Do their proposed contribution have limitations? Are the assumptions made by the authors reasonable, is the methodology OK? What are the design tradeoffs? If their idea was proposed on a small scale, would it scale to a large system easily? Is there work that you know of that does the same thing and is not referenced? If it is a survey/book section, is it complete, well organized. Would future work reference this work a lot either for this contribution, completeness or clarity (book section).

How well did the writers back their claims up with numbers? Did they give any evidence? You should mention the main numbers that support the claims. For instance, they were able to reduce power consumption on a laptop by 37%.

A good referee does not just hammer papers. A good referee can actually make nice suggestions to improve the paper. If you were a referee for this paper, what did you not like about this paper? What did you like about this paper? Do you have any suggestions on what they could do to improve the paper?

Finally, after reading the paper, did you have project ideas? Are there interesting ways you thought to extend their work? Note that even if you describe ideas about extending this paper, you won't be forced to do them. You can just talk about your ideas.